REVIEW OF TRAINING CURRICULUM AND MANUALS ON COMBATTING TRAFFICKING IN AFGHANISTAN

March 2017

IOM • OIM

SAMUEL HALL.
This report has been produced by Samuel Hall’s Migration and Displacement Pillar. At the Migration and Displacement Pillar, we produce knowledge and data on population movements in and out of countries of origin, transit and destination. Using quantitative and qualitative, participatory research with migrants, refugees and internally displaced persons, we build evidence on their social environment, protection, livelihoods, contributions and aspirations. We use this evidence to deliver trainings and capacity building to actors shaping the lives of migrants, and to design programmes and policies that adhere to international frameworks. Our approach is inductive and contextually relevant. We are known for our expertise and seek researchers with expertise in:

**Migration**
- Migration and development
- Irregular migration
- Smuggling
- Migration-employment nexus
- Labour migration and mobility
- Policy development

**Displacement**
- Internal Displacement
- Forced migration
- Trafficking
- Return and reintegration, including post-return outcomes, voluntary and involuntary returns
- Durable solutions

This publication was commissioned by the International Organization for Migration (IOM) and was prepared and conducted solely by Samuel Hall. The report should be cited using the following referencing style:


**About Samuel Hall.**

Samuel Hall is an independent think tank providing research and strategic services, expert analysis, tailored counsel and access to local knowledge for a diverse array of actors operating in the world’s most challenging environments. We specialize in migration research, economic and social assessments, strategy and policy design and monitoring and evaluations across Central & South Asia, East & Southern Africa, West Africa, and Europe. Over the last seven years, we have developed an impressive portfolio of clients, which includes UN agencies (UNHCR, UNICEF, WFP, UNDP, etc.), international NGOs (AKF, NRC, DRC, Oxfam, etc.), donors (DFID, EU, AFD, JICA, GIZ, etc.) and international organizations such as IOM and the World Bank.
Table of Contents

Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 4
Desk Review on Combating TiP in Afghanistan .............................................................................. 6
  1. A short review of the Literature .......................................................................................... 6
  2. Evaluation of the available trainings and curricula on combating Trafficking in Afghanistan .... 10
Conclusion and Recommendations .............................................................................................. 14
  1. Continued Gap 1: Confusion around using the language to address Smuggling and Trafficking in Persons in Dari ................................................................. 14
  2. Continued Gap 2: Lack of Coordination between different governmental sectors as well as non-governmental organisations due to knowledge gaps ................................................................. 16
  3. Key Finding 1: Missing link between the media and NGOs in Afghanistan ......................... 18
  4. Key Finding 2: Unsustainable trainings and capacity-building fatigue ................................. 21
Bibliography ................................................................................................................................. 24
Annexes ......................................................................................................................................... 25
Contacts .......................................................................................................................................... 33

Tables and figures
Table 1 Research questions ........................................................................................................... 5
Table 2 Profile of Key Informants .................................................................................................. 5
Table 3 Key Findings of the Evaluation Matrix and Key Informant Interviews ............................. 10

Figure 1 Suggested tools for trainings on combating TIP (ICMPD) .................................................. 8
Figure 2 Key gaps in TiP trainings in Afghanistan ......................................................................... 13
Figure 3 "TiP Community of Practice" Training Model .................................................................. 23

List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CTiP</td>
<td>Combating Trafficking in Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVC</td>
<td>Community Vigilance Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development (United Kingdom)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIROA</td>
<td>Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICMPD</td>
<td>International Centre for Migration Policy Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International Organization for Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JSSP</td>
<td>Justice Sector Support Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD-DAC</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development Assistance Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiP</td>
<td>Trafficking in Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHCR</td>
<td>United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNODC</td>
<td>United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VoT</td>
<td>Victim of Trafficking</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

1. Background

Human trafficking has a long history within and from Afghanistan and is an “extremely sensitive issue, linked with migration, poverty, social exclusion, gender, sexuality, work, sex, money, power and violence”. Afghanistan is a source, transit, and destination country for men, women, and children subjected to human trafficking. Although pictures of boys working in brick factories, girls in the carpet-making industry first come to mind when speaking of Trafficking in Persons (TiP) in Afghanistan, other vulnerable populations are victims of TiP, such as child brides used to resolve conflicts (Bad Dadan), “dancing boys” used as sex slaves by older men, and persons in situations of bonded labour.

A 2014 study conducted by Samuel Hall, based on 300 interviews with victims, community members, and key informants across nine provinces of Afghanistan, confirmed that, despite growing awareness among key government officials, non-governmental organisations (NGOs), care providers and the media on trafficking in persons, the nature of the awareness on definitions and trends of trafficking in persons remains overall limited.

The 2014 study recommended a central focus on trainings based on well-designed workshops for stakeholders that allow for a review of concepts (theory) along with their application in real life settings (practice) among government officials. Although a number of trainings have indeed been conducted to build conceptual and institutional capacities of key stakeholders, a lack of a clear understanding on human trafficking persists.

In this context, the International Organization for Migration (IOM) has commissioned Samuel Hall to review current counter-trafficking training curricula and manuals in order to provide recommendations for improvement, and to incorporate the voices of participants to respond to knowledge gaps and practical challenges by:

i. **Reviewing all available training materials** (curricula, manuals and any other support materials), which are currently being used by stakeholders providing training to Afghan officials on human trafficking, sexual and gender-based violence and the promotion of safe employment and labour migration.

ii. **Identifying areas of opportunity and limitations in the existing training materials**, providing recommendations on how to move forward on these.

2. Research questions

Based on the OECD-DAC criteria and on the key gaps identified in the 2014 Samuel Hall study, the following questions have guided the research team’s analysis of the information gathered in the literature review, the evaluation of the training materials, and key informant interviews.

---

1. IOM Request for Proposal, 2016
4. Ibid
Table 1 Research questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research areas</th>
<th>Research questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1: Relevance</td>
<td><strong>Content</strong>: To what degree do existing manuals and trainings include all key information? What, if any, information is missing? How, if at all, do the materials reconcile the current situation in Afghanistan with international frameworks?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2: Effectiveness</td>
<td><strong>Quality</strong>: How clear and well-adapted is the language of the materials? How well do participants in trainings and readers of materials understand the material being presented? What are the key challenges to their doing so?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3: Efficiency</td>
<td>From a <strong>practical</strong> perspective: How widespread are the tools/materials themselves? Who participates in trainings and in how many numbers?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4: Impact</td>
<td><strong>Impact</strong>: How, if at all, has the material from these trainings and manuals impacted the TiP situation in Afghanistan? What would help it do so better?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5: Sustainability</td>
<td><strong>Stakeholder mapping and interest</strong>: Which are the stakeholders participating in these trainings, and creating materials and holding the trainings? How can they ensure that the material taught is remembered? In the long-term, who should have responsibility for this and why?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Methodology

The assessment framework focused on a literature review, key informant interviews, and an evaluation matrix of existing training materials, based on a purely qualitative approach.

The **Literature Review** covering trends of trafficking in persons in Afghanistan, gaps in combating trafficking in Afghanistan and good practices on trainings on combating trafficking for a wide variety of stakeholders.

The **Evaluation Matrix** focused on the relevance and effectiveness of training materials - providing an overall score for each training material, to identify respective strengths and weaknesses. In the table below, the relevant questions are presented. It was adapted from the strength of quality framework developed by DFID. Each document was analysed separately, to identify the common strengths and weaknesses. The Evaluation Matrix tool can be found in Annex 1, and the list of reviewed document can be found in Annex 2.

Strategic **Key Informant Interviews (KII)**s were conducted from the onset of the project and throughout its duration to inform recommendations (see Annex section for more detail).

Table 2 Profile of Key Informants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Beneficiaries of existing trainings</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>External stakeholders</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. **A short review of the Literature**

   a. **Defining Trafficking in Persons (globally and in Afghanistan)**

According to Article 3 (a) of the Palermo Protocol, “human trafficking” refers to “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation”.

In the 2017 revised Afghan law to combat trafficking in persons and smuggling of migrants, which has adopted the same definition for trafficking in persons, exploitation is defined as “taking advantage of the victim of trafficking in persons through buying, selling, sexual exploitation, dancing (bacha bazi), for the production of pornographic images or films, slavery, forced labor, begging, armed conflict, removal of organs, medical experiments or forcing the person to commit other illegal activities.”

Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling in Persons must be distinguished. Although several studies have argued that human smuggling can readily degenerate into trafficking, smuggling is “more than a profit-seeking criminal activity that involves crossing borders illegally”, it is also a community-based service provided to willing clients. Indeed, the lack of consent and the presence of coercion and exploitation are central to identifying and defining cases of Trafficking in Persons. In cases of trafficking, consent is absent, based on fraudulent terms, or given under coercion. Threats, force, and violence are commonly used to ensure the compliance of trafficked victims.

Misconceptions about consent and coercion have led many victims to perceive their situations as normal, limiting their ability to speak up about their situation and seek protection. The challenge for counter-trafficking efforts is stemmed from both lack of proper incident reporting from the victims and insufficient capacity to identify the victims and build a response.

> “Coercion and consent are in and of themselves concepts that may be difficult to identify and define. In some cases examined in this research, the victim may have given consent, e.g. in the case of an arranged marriage [...] Most victims do not recognise that this coercion is in contradiction with their rights [...]. In addition to coercion, the concept of consent can also be misinterpreted. In one case, a 12-year-old Afghan girl was considered by her own defence lawyer to have given consent to the neighbour who raped her because she had accepted a car ride from him”. While not a case of trafficking, this example demonstrates the need for greater clarity around issues of consent and coercion in Afghanistan.” (Samuel Hall, 2014: 14)

---

11 Samuel Hall, "Old Practice, New Chains: Modern Slavery in Afghanistan", 2014 commissioned by IOM.
b. Learning from best practices: key takeaways from the literature on effective training materials

**Best practices in designing training curricula**
To improve the effectiveness of the trainings on TiP, the International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD) suggests to design the materials for each group of audience based on four questions: “WHAT is to be done; WHEN is action to be taken; WHO should be involved and; HOW should the action be executed.”

Building on van Hagen (2013), two complementary approaches can support effective training design:

1. **Community of practice** is put forth to adopt a multidisciplinary approach based on inter-agency cooperation to foster collaboration and consistency in a long-term approach to counter-trafficking. By bringing together representatives of the government, NGOs, civil society members and the media around a common objective, participants will develop a shared knowledge of each other’s role in combating TIP.

2. **Community-based approach** in an effort to design trainings with a participatory approach to combatting trafficking and protecting victims in a supportive environment, to empower both communities at risk and empower individuals.

**Designing materials: Five key principles**
The preliminary literature review has identified the following as necessary principles for the development of effective training materials:
- Training material **integrates** international standards
- Training material **adapts** its messaging to its target audience
- Training material **adapts** its content to relate to local understandings of trafficking
- Training material **is updated** regularly to fit with evolving local trends in TiP
- Training materials are **based on methodological tools** for each stakeholder group.

This last principle has been identified in the literature to choose the right methodological tools for each group of the participants to make sure they reach their goals from the training. To ensure ownership, it is suggested to employ interactive tools to facilitate the learning process. ICMPD recommends the inclusion of the following tools for trainings on combating TIP:

---

13 ibid
Engaging the media
Widely recognised as a core strategy to increase the efficiency of counter-trafficking is the necessary engagement with the media to raise awareness among a wide audience composed of the general population as well as civil society organisations. Key to this approach is to bridge the gap that exists between the understanding of and the response to the prevalence of TiP, and to support NGO and government response to the issue. In the triangle between NGOs, governments and the media, the latter plays a vital role in connecting organisations and governments to the general public.\(^\text{16}\) Engaging with the media has become an established practice for NGOs to reach out to the public and inform them about important issues facing the society at large, and sensitise people to the responsibilities and efforts of civil society actors, to strengthen societal and community links that will facilitate referrals, response, accountability and sustainability at large.\(^\text{17}\)

---


Case study 1: Trainings of local journalists

The US Department of State Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons reports that, in 2015, an India-based NGO “engaged with journalists to raise awareness of human trafficking within minority and marginalized communities”\(^{18}\). Trainings included sections on how to better report multiple types of cases of human trafficking in their local language. According to the US Department of State, “reporters uncovered human trafficking cases within their own communities and increased attention on the role of state government and police in prevention efforts”\(^{19}\).

Case study 2: Engaging local broadcasters

In 2005, in cooperation with Cambodian broadcasters, the BBC World Service Trust produced a soap opera called “Taste of Life”. It was part of a broader multimedia anti-trafficking package that included TV shows, radio programs and printed material\(^{20}\). This drama series featured trafficking stories based in cases provided by ILO. It reached 69 percent of all TV viewership in Cambodia. Later on, a survey on the outcomes of this project showed that an increase in public awareness about TIP, and the increased ability for the public to link migration and trafficking\(^{21}\).

\(^{18}\) Trafficking in Persons Report 2016: Meeting the Global Challenge: Effective Strategies To Prevent Human Trafficking,
\(^{19}\) Ibid
\(^{21}\) Ibid., 92.
2. Evaluation of the available trainings and curricula on combating Trafficking in Afghanistan

Table 3 Key Findings of the Evaluation Matrix and Key Informant Interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research areas</th>
<th>Key findings of the evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1: Relevance</td>
<td>Afghan and international laws are well-explained, but there is a limited attention to the local context in most of the training materials: “real life” examples of TiP in Afghanistan are absent from most trainings, as well as the latest trends – such as “trafficking for terrorism training” – are not considered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2: Effectiveness</td>
<td>The language of the materials is well understandable and well-adapted to their target audience, but all the training materials suffer from the lack of provision of necessary information for target audiences. The methodological tools are not interactive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3: Efficiency</td>
<td>Due to high turnover within organisations and in the government, there is a lack of consistency in attendance by training participants. Stakeholders obtain different levels of information and confusing messages, hampering the objective of creating a common base of knowledge and a community of practice – that cuts across stakeholder groups – on TiP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4: Impact</td>
<td>The resistance from NGOs and government to use the term <em>Tejarat-e-Ensan</em> to designate Trafficking in Persons may hamper progress. Resistance in using a specific Dari term for TiP in Afghanistan results in delays the awareness raising process. The absence of the media is an obstacle to raise awareness in the population.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5: Sustainability</td>
<td>The high number of capacity-building trainings in Afghanistan and the absence of a plan for engagement of participants during the trainings lead to a capacity-building fatigue.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The completed evaluation matrix can be found in Annex 6, and the detailed evaluation of each document can be found in Annex 7.

The following section develops the key gaps indicated in Table 3.

**Key Strengths**
There are three strengths that can be identified in most of the materials reviewed:

1. Afghan as well as International laws are well-defined and explained;
2. The language of the materials is easy to understand;
3. The language is largely well-adapted to the target audience; and translations in Pashto and Dari are adequate.
**Key reference to design trainings:** IOM - Handbook on direct assistance for victims of trafficking (2007)

The IOM Handbook on direct assistance for victims of trafficking includes all the necessary information, reviews all aspects of TiP in global level, some in details and some being briefly mentioned. In addition, the language of the handbook is clear and understandable for the readers; it explains the international framework on trafficking in persons thoroughly; and it is usable for wide range of audience. If updated to 2017 and adapted to the Afghan context, it can be used as a key reference to make sure relevant content is included in the training.

**Key Limitations and Necessary Mitigation Strategies**

The key limitations and mitigation strategies identified by the research team are present at three levels – at the level of stakeholders, concepts, communities and people:

**STAKEHOLDERS:** Improving the quality and quantity of information provided in trainings:

All the training materials suffer from the lack of provision of all necessary information for specific target audiences.

1. There is **limited information** about identifying the victims and differentiating the victims from the perpetrators/criminals\(^\text{22}\). **Criteria for identification of VoT** are not presented. Although it is provided for care providers by Hagar International - in details - but it is not mentioned in the same vein in trainings for police officers, government officials, and at risk communities. This is the key gap on theoretical competencies among training providers.

2. As a result, stakeholders obtain different levels of information and different contents, hampering the objective of creating a common base of knowledge and a community of practice – that cuts across stakeholder groups – on Trafficking in Persons.

**CONCEPTS:** Untangle common confusion and amalgams around trafficking, persistent among those who have undertaken trainings:

Confusion persists on the trafficking-security nexus, and trafficking-smuggling nexus. One of the key principles of training on TiP should be to adapt to the local context. Changing local trends, whether rumoured or true, should be covered through a strong evidence base to prove or disprove commonly held assumptions.

3. **Lack of harmonisation of language in training materials.** A direct consequence of the disagreement over terms is the lack of harmonisation across training materials. Different trainees have been exposed to different languages, creating greater confusion. In the training materials produced by different trainer organisations, particularly Hagar International and IOM, there is no harmony in using a specific term

\(^{22}\) With the exception of the Training for Care Providers, Hagar
to refer to TiP. All abovementioned four terms have been used in the training materials. Although in the training materials produced by Hagar International, the term Qachaq-e-Ensan is used, the other terms, such as Tejarat-e-Ensan and Trafficking, has been used in IOM training materials, There is a lack of coordination between the trainer NGOs to harmonise in-use vocabulary in their trainings. As another example, in a project under the supervision of IOM and Internews, Salamwatandar radio produces featured content related to TiP in Afghanistan. In one of the programs the term Tejarat-e-Ensan is used to refer to TiP, and in another program the term Qachaq-e-Ensan is used. This shows that the confusion exists not only among Afghan government officials and NGO workers, but also among those who conduct training for combating TiP in Afghanistan. This will call – in the next steps and recommendations – to a needed top-down effort on producing a common messaging in all trainings related to TiP. Hence, improving the materials that are used for anti-trafficking trainings in Afghanistan includes a strategy to clear up this confusion around terminology and avoid producing/reproducing new challenges.

4. **Addressing new identified trends for improved clarity.** According to two respondents, there is a new trend in trafficking in Afghanistan worthy of attention in action: trafficking for the purpose of being trained to become a terrorist. “The other practice in TiP is training terrorists. Probably some don’t want to talk about it due to political reasons, but we have to tackle this issue.” Emerging new trends should be addressed in a more dynamic manner by the training providers, based on global standards and a comprehensive assessment of TiP trends in Afghanistan.

**COMMUNITIES and PEOPLE: A participatory approach to empowering communities and victims to combat trafficking and protection victims of trafficking:**

**In the Short term:**

5. **There is no plan for engagement of participants** during the trainings. First, participants are not made aware of the coordination and referral systems, which limits their ability to follow up on what they have learned. Second, there is limited follow-up after trainings, which limits their retention of information, and from keeping in touch with other participants when it can benefit their work.

6. **The variety of the tools being used in the trainings is very limited.** The lecture-based model hinders the interactivity of the training and contributes to the “capacity-building fatigue”, whereby participants feel disengaged.

**In the Medium term:**

7. **There is no detailed information about the role of media in awareness raising and information campaigning.** Stakeholders have a partial knowledge about the role that the media can play in the field of TiP. Part of this lack of knowledge stems from misunderstandings and competing expectations about the role of media in the development and humanitarian field. It is a challenge for NGOs in Afghanistan to

---

23 The research team reviewed three of the “Investigative reports on TiP” programmes

24 KI05, Justice Support Sector Program (JSSP). KI07, Hagar International

25 KI07, Hagar International

26 KI08, legal researcher, Independent
understand the logic of media’s work in the country and to identify what is the media’s current range of concern.

In the Longer term:

8. There is little mention of the **reintegration process of victims into society** and how they can be empowered once they are rescued from their trafficked situations. Reintegration process of victims in their own societies is important for both care providers and at risk communities, and is a necessary component of a sustainable TiP response as it protects the victim from being trafficked again, and the community to fall victim to trafficking.

9. There is a **limited attention to the local context** in most of the materials: “real life” examples of TiP in Afghanistan are absent from most trainings, which limits the ability of the participants to develop a concrete understanding of trafficking in their country, region, and community.

Figure 2 Key gaps in TiP trainings in Afghanistan

- **Stakeholders**
  - Limited information about identifying the victims and differentiating the victims from the perpetrators/criminals
  - Stakeholders obtain different levels of information which limits their capacity to join a community of practice

- **Concepts**
  - Lack of harmonisation of language in training materials
  - Confusion between TiP and smuggling
  - New trends are not addressed dynamically

- **Communities and people**
  - No plan for engagement of participant
  - Limited variety of tools
  - No detailed information about the role of media in awareness raising and information campaigning
  - Lack of information on the reintegration processes of VoTs
  - Limited attention to the local context
Conclusion and Recommendations

This concluding section presents two persistent gaps identified in the 2014 Samuel Hall study, and two key findings from this research, each accompanied by key recommendations that IOM must take into account to design sustainable trainings on combating TiP in Afghanistan and foster a community of practice on counter-trafficking in Afghanistan by designing interactive and collaborative training curricula and materials.

1. Continued Gap 1: Confusion around using the language to address Smuggling and Trafficking in Persons in Dari

In its 2014 report for IOM, Samuel Hall identified that the use of language, terminologies, and translation between English and Dari contributes to the persistent, widespread confusion between trafficking and smuggling. The word commonly used for trafficking in Dari—Qachaq—is used to refer to all types of illegal transport, whether of drugs, arms or persons.27 The conceptual ambiguity that using this term caused in the Afghan context led IOM to promote the following term in Dari to refer to Trafficking in Persons to resolve this ambiguity: Tejarat-e-Ensan.

Reviewing the training materials, and through conducting KII, it became clear that the confusion remains among officials, NGO workers, and even trainers themselves. Four different terms in Dari were used during the interviews by the 11 respondents to designate TiP: Tejarat-e-Ensan, Qachaq-e-Ensan, Ghachagh, and Trafficking (تراافوکینگ).

**What is notable in 2017 is the resistance to the use of the term Tejarat-e-Ensan**

As highlighted by Key Informant Interviews, there is a resistance from NGOs and government to use the term Tejarat-e-Ensan to designate Trafficking in Persons. Resistance in using a specific Dari term for TiP in Afghanistan could potentially lead to delays in the awareness raising process.

This resistance rests on two key concerns highlighted during the interviews. First, as the term Qachaq-e-Ensan is used in the Afghan law on combating TiP and smuggling to refer to TiP, it is more common among officials and local CSO community to use this term. A key informant from the Afghanistan Justice Sector Support Program (JSSP) breaks down the issue as follows:

“The commission [High Commission to combat Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants] has decided to not use Tejarat-e-Ensan as the translation of Human Trafficking. The terms that we use now, which are also being used in Afghan law and constitution, are Qachaq-e-Ensan for Human Trafficking or Trafficking in Persons and Qachaq-e-Mohajerin for Smuggling. There is an article about the human trafficking in Afghan law. In that article and related articles, the term Qachaq-e-Ensan has been used. So there is no point to use another word that people are unfamiliar with.”28

---

28 KI05, Justice Support Sector Program (JSSP)
Second, the term *Tejarat-E-Ensān* is being used in Iranian Farsi. According to some Key Informants, considering language sensitivities in Afghanistan, it is important for Afghans to limit the imported words and terms from Iranian Farsi to Dari. “It is preferred to use the term *Qachaq-e-Ensān*, not *Tejarat-e-Ensān*, in Dari. Since the second term is in Iranian Farsi, many people would not like to use it. Probably it is correct to use the latter in terms of terminology, but the first term is more understandable for people and officials here in Afghanistan.”

There are trade-offs, pros and cons, under each of these terms. Our analysis shows that using the term *Tejarat-e-Ensān*, due to its clear distinctiveness to *Ghachgah-e-Ensān*, leads to avoid mistaking smuggling and TiP with each other in Dari. On the other hand, the term *Tejarat-e-Ensān* provides a better interpretation of trafficking in persons in Dari, from linguistic point of view. While the term *Qachaq-e-Ensān* can be easier to be promoted in Dari since it is already being used in the law and official communications in Afghanistan, it is worth noticing that it does not offer the same level of clarity and distinctiveness as *Tejarat-e-Ensān* in the Dari Language. These have to be taken carefully into consideration to settle the linguistic disputes which represent an obstacle to training and implementation.

**Recommendations**

1) **Adopting a community-based approach** in the process of choosing and promoting a new terminology. This would require:

- Involving the local government officials and organisations in the process of choosing and promoting the new term;
- Considering the cultural and historical background of Afghanistan in the process;
- Assess the result of the choosing the new term by getting the feedback from local communities based on a planned timeline;

2) **Harmonising the terminology** in all training materials, media outputs, governmental announcements, and Afghan law with cooperation of all involved actors. This can be achieved by:

- Providing a comprehensive manual on TiP training, to be used in Afghanistan based on the country’s context;
- Make an organisation, be it governmental or non-governmental, responsible for monitoring the terminologies of the training materials and governmental announcements and Afghan law being used across the country;
- Engaging local media to promote the new term in public sphere;

---

29 KI07, Hagar International
2. Continued Gap 2: Lack of Coordination between different governmental sectors as well as non-governmental organisations due to knowledge gaps

One of the vital factors to effectively combat trafficking in a country is to establish a solid coordination platform for the involvement of key stakeholders. The lack of coordination among governmental and non-governmental organizations was raised in several key informant interviews. This issue was raised during one of the interviews, “The biggest problem [to combat trafficking in Afghanistan] is the lack of coordination and cooperation between different departments and ministries (police, prosecutor, judges).”

There are three aspects of this issue that need to be addressed by providing key information consistently about the Coordination structure, Referral systems, and the Criteria for identification of VoT:

**Lack of coordination between different governmental units on TiP**

It was found out during the interviews that, first, governmental units combating trafficking in Afghanistan have very limited information about the works and role of other governmental units in the area of combating trafficking, and second, there is no agreement on the list of actors and their roles in the national picture of combating trafficking in Afghanistan.

For example, as the answer to a question about the responsible organisation for conducting the TiP trainings in the long term, the responses vary from Ministry of Information and Culture to the High Commission to Combat Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants, to Ministry of Interior, and to Government in general. On this account, a Key Informant from the Ministry of Justice, takes one step further and suggests to, “develop a plan and mechanisms for effective coordination on the region level” to help Afghanistan to overcome this issue and work towards combating TiP in the country.

**Lack of knowledge over the referral system for VoTs**

When interviewees were asked about the first organisation responsible to receive the victims of trafficking or any complaint about TiP in Afghanistan, the answers varied from police, to the ministry of interior, to ministry of migrants and repatriates. It is a clear sign that there is no established, functional referral system in the country to identify and refer the victims of trafficking to the responsible organisation. Indeed, it stems from and reproduces lack of coordination in the country. A weak or non-existent referral system in Afghanistan for victims of trafficking has weakened the coordination chain among the involved actors.

Although the Ministry of Labour, Social affairs, Martyrs and Disabled has introduced a referral system for referring of the victims of trafficking in Afghanistan, but it fails to be a united referral system for all the involved actors. Nevertheless, there is a low level of awareness about this referral system among the other units and organisations who are involved in combating trafficking in the country. It was not even mentioned once during the interviews that there is a referral system in Afghanistan for referring the victims of trafficking.

**No consensus on identification of victims of trafficking among governmental and non-governmental bodies**

The first step in referring the victims of trafficking to responsible organisations is to identify the victim. The process of identification of victims in Afghanistan faces two major challenges: first,
there is lack of awareness about the ways to identify the victims, and second, lack of will in implementation of law in identification and support of victims to the extent that in many cases the victims of trafficking are being punished as criminals.

Lack of awareness to identify the victims is mostly rooted in lack of knowledge about definition of TiP and its differences with migration, smuggling or domestic violence. Although there is a good understanding of TiP among high officials in the government or NGOs, but low rank officials who deal with TiP incidents on the ground suffer from a lack of knowledge about this phenomenon.

This lack of knowledge also leads to misidentification of victims and mistakenly taking them as criminal. The other reason for this is stemmed from traditions and cultural practices in Afghanistan. "Badal dadan" is a good example of a practice that is well rooted in the culture and society in some areas in Afghanistan, but is not identified as form of trafficking for many. Or, as another example, the case of trafficking for the purpose of training terrorists is not widely considered as a pervasive form of trafficking in Afghanistan. As described by a key informant, “For boys, it [trafficking] is mostly about training them to become a suicide bomber, and sexual abuse or as you know bacha bazi. There are some reports about spread of fundamentalism ideologies in some girl schools mostly in the north of the country."33

On the other hand, in the case of sexual exploitation of women, there are many cases that the victim is being treated as the perpetrator or criminal. Mistreating the victim as criminal makes it even more difficult to identify the victims. As Fatema Ahmadi states, “One of the problems [in identifying victims of trafficking] is that the victims, particularly women, don’t talk about the incidents happened to them to their families or anyone else due to fear of stigma.”34 This stigma, though, is mostly comes from the society, but law enforcement agencies perpetuate the stigma by misidentification of the victims and criminals.

**Recommendations**

1) **Including the topic of inter and intra organisational coordination in the training materials.** It includes:

- Discussions on concrete structure of coordination within the government and between government and NGOs;
- Defining the tasks and responsibilities of different units within the anti-trafficking field;
- Unification of the training materials for the whole country by producing a comprehensive guideline on TiP trainings for Afghanistan;

2) **Inviting participants from different sectors involved in combating TiP to the trainings.** It includes:

- Providing the opportunity through different tools in the trainings for active networking of participants and exchanging information;
- Inviting the participants from relevant sectors whose tasks need to function in coordination with others;

3) **Focusing on the topic of identification of VoTs.** It includes:

---

33 KI06, 8 Sobh newspaper
34 KI07, Hagar International
• Defining the victims of trafficking based on a national consensus for relevant sectors;
• Addressing those specific trafficking practices that rooted in traditions of the society in the trainings;
• Explaining the referral system from identification of victims to connecting them to support centres.

4) **Provide a comprehensive list of examples of TiP in Afghanistan:** In order to include it in the trainings based on the needs of the target audience. For example, identifying victims and differentiating them from criminals are very important for both police officers and at risk communities, and reintegration process of victims in their own societies is important for both care providers and at risk communities.

4) **Map out trends of TiP in Afghanistan,** focusing on the profiles of victims, their geographical location, and assessing whether current trends (such as trafficking for the purpose of being trained to become a terrorist) is to be considered a TiP trend under global standards.

3. **Key Finding 1: Missing link between the media and NGOs in Afghanistan**

There is a need to build a close relationship between the trainer institutions and local as well as international media in Afghanistan, as it is through that the media that “NGOs aim and appeal, images and ideas are principally disseminated and become known”, and that “public sympathies and support are periodically galvanised in humanitarian appeals”. The media can be the missing link between government/NGOs and the general population to raise awareness on TiP in the society. In other words, engaging the media is key to channel the message about TiP to the right target audience in Afghanistan. To make the link, it is important to acknowledge the current strengths and weaknesses in the relationship between the media, NGOs, and the government.

**Lack of knowledge about the role of media in the humanitarian/development field**

The first issue that was identified during the research is the NGOs’ partial knowledge about the role that the media can play in the field of TiP. Part of this lack of knowledge stems from misunderstandings and competing expectations about the role of media in the development and humanitarian field. It is a challenge for NGOs in Afghanistan to understand the logic of media’s work in the country and to identify what is the media’s current range of concern.

While it is common practice at the global level, the NGO sector in Afghanistan does not currently develop communication strategies and provide packaging information to feed the media on events and topics of interest.

One Key Informant suggests that misunderstanding might come from an unrealistic expectation from the media in Afghanistan:

---

35 IOM request for proposal, 2016
“Media is doing business, not trying to change the world. They are in private sector. We expect the media to go out and raise awareness for us [NGOs] and address the problems [on behalf of us]. It’s actually NGOs job to reach out to media to invite them on board and ask them to raise awareness on the issues that concern NGOs.”

On the other hand, the media do not have enough information about the work of NGOs in Afghanistan. Due to high level of sensitivity, it is very important for the media to have a comprehensive knowledge about the topic they want to report related to the work of NGOs. For example, a recent article that was published by Pajhwok about TiP, illustrates the opportunities and challenges in terms of involving the media in TiP awareness-raising. Although the journalist who wrote the article has enough background to identify ‘bacha bazi’ as a form of human trafficking, he did not link it to any form of prevention/prosecution under legal trafficking frameworks (such as the High Commission to Combat Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants, or 2017 revised Afghan law to combat trafficking in persons and smuggling of migrants). Thus, it is also crucial for the journalists, who are working in this field, to have vast and thorough knowledge about the topic. However, as development field is a small fraction of the journalism work, it is expected to see the media not allocating enough resources to work on the related topics to development/humanitarian field.

Consequently, this lack of knowledge has led to lack of communication and interaction between media and NGOs in Afghanistan. As pointed out by a media representative, “there is zero communication between the media, involved institutions and NGOs, and relevant units in the government.” In fact, lack of knowledge and lack of communication reproduce each other in Afghanistan’s context through a vicious circle.

**Lack of means to make a connection between the media and NGOs**

Another reason for the absence of a functional link between media and NGOs in humanitarian/development field in Afghanistan is lack of means for both sides to work and communicate with each other. First, many NGOs in Afghanistan suffer from insufficient capacity to interact with the media. Be it poor structure in communication sector of the NGOs, or lack of concrete plan or agenda in using the media in their projects, NGOs fail to engage the media to support their objectives.

As pointed out by a representative from Internews, “NGOs, particularly here in Afghanistan, do not have public relation sector or simple communication officer. CSOs do not know how to deal with the media and can’t use them in their projects. Even when media go to them to provide a report about the NGOs activities, CSO members don’t know whom they should send to talk to media, and there is no agenda to do it.”

Second, while there are many fields that the local media and NGOs share interest in Afghanistan, including smuggling and trafficking in persons, the media have limited capacity to provide report related to these fields. As a media representative explains, “One of the most common reports that we get is about abuse of those who voluntarily wanted to smuggle themselves out of the country. It happens a lot in the province of Nimrooz. It is also so

---

37 KI09, Internews Afghanistan  
39 KI06, 8 Sobh newspaper  
40 KI09, Internews Afghanistan
dangerous for journalists to go there and gather information. That is one of the reasons that we don’t have that much information about these incidents.”

It is difficult for the media to address certain issues and work on specific topics in Afghanistan due to the dangers they would encounter. As NGOs usually enjoy high capacity and experience in providing security and safety in their projects for their staff, supporting journalists in this regard can be one step forward in removing the obstacles in the way more communication between media and NGOs.

**Lack of trust between the media and NGOs/government**

From NGOs’ standpoint, it is difficult to trust the media. Indeed, part of this mistrust is stemmed from lack of knowledge about the work of the media. Besides, since NGO work is sensitive by nature, allowing another sector with low expertise on the matter to report about NGOs activities might prove a challenge.

Unfortunately, very limited effort has been made to build trust between the media and NGOs in Afghanistan. Fateme Ahmadi from Hagar International acknowledges this deficiency. She says, “We haven’t invited the media on board for the trainings or being part of the combating TiP in the country. We also need to invite them. We need to have media more involved in our projects and educate them about our activities.”

To conclude, we need to acknowledge that linking NGOs and the local media in Afghanistan and providing the ground for their communication is impossible if there is no knowledge about it for both media and NGOs, no means provided for them, and no trust is built between them. Due to this fact that all the above mentioned problems are highly intertwined, it is important to plan a comprehensive plan to tackle these issues in the Afghan context.

**Recommendations**

1) **Inviting media representatives** and journalists to the trainings. It includes:

   - Design specific trainings for journalists in Afghanistan to develop their skills and build capacity for media in the country;
   - Invite journalists to participate in the trainings with NGOs workers and government officials in order to provide the ground for networking and basic communication.

2) **Providing necessary information about the relationship between media and government /NGOs**, with an emphasis on TiP, during the trainings. It includes:

   - Including sections in the trainings for government officials and NGOs about the work of media;
   - Including sections in the trainings for journalists about the work of NGOs;
   - Including sections in the trainings about the role that media can play in awareness raising and information campaigns, and the help that media can provide for NGOs to extend their projects and reach out masses;

3) **Support both media and NGOs in their works in relation to each other** based on their needs and demands. It includes:

---

41 KI06, 8 Sobh newspaper
• Training journalists about work of journalism in conflict zone;
• Direct NGOs to provide the means to communicate with the media. It can include training communication officers to work with the media;

4. **Key Finding 2: Unsustainable trainings and capacity-building fatigue**

A high number of NGOs and IOs in Afghanistan have invested in capacity building for officials, in a wide range of topics. This leads to a 'capacity building fatigue', with a limited impact of additional trainings. One respondent who had attended a high number of trainings stated: "I think I have attended a couple of trainings on TIP but I can't remember much".

Moreover, some Key Informants have suggested that the trainings attended are not sustainable due to two main factors: a high turn-over in staff in government institutions and NGOs, and the absence of follow-up after the training.

**Recommendations**

To ensure the sustainability of the trainings, it is recommended to follow a set of considerations in designing and conducting the trainings:

1) **Design specific trainings for students and trainees, notably border police**;

2) **Design specific trainings for local shuras, and women shuras**, as they are both potential victims and care providers;

3) **Design a follow up system**: There has to be a follow up system on the trainings delivered. For example, two months later from the date when the training is delivered, a different team should visit the trainees and ask questions on his/her personal and professional life that how much been effected;

4) **Participatory character of trainings**: All trainings should involve one participatory section to design the training as a group;

4) **Adopt a community-based approach** in designing the materials and curriculum:

   • “Giving real examples from their district or neighbourhood” and considering the language and cultural sensitivities for each region;
   • Collaborative efforts vs. classroom learning: Participatory and community-based discussions on the design of the materials and curriculum can be built in a workshop-setting where participants are also given guidelines and frameworks to follow;
   • Sharing both empirical and theoretical inputs to designing the materials, with relevant stakeholders;

---

42 KI08, legal researcher, Independent
43 KI05, Justice Support Sector Program (JSSP)
44 KI03, Human Rights Support Unit and TIP High Commission, Ministry of Justice
45 KI02, Ministry of Women Affairs
4) **Engage participants through a community of practice and peer-training** through the following model that allows for ownership of the participants, the development of a community of practice, and peer-learning.

The following figure described the recommended model of designing trainings on TiP in Afghanistan. It is based on the gaps identified in the scope of this research, and the two main elements identified in the literature, namely:

- The need to put forth to adopt a **multidisciplinary approach based on inter-agency cooperation** to foster collaboration and consistency in a long term approach to counter-trafficking.
- The need to **design a community-based approach** in an effort to design trainings with a participatory approach to combatting trafficking and protecting victims in a supportive environment.

5) **The training should be designed in line with the five guiding principles for TiP trainings identified in the literature.**

- Training material **integrates** international standards
- Training material **adapts** its messaging to its target audience
- Training material **adapts** its content to relate to local understandings of trafficking
- Training material **is updated** regularly to fit with evolving local trends in TiP
- Training materials are **based on methodological tools** for each stakeholder group.

6) **Develop comprehensive ‘training of trainers’ materials** to ensure that trainers deliver consistent messaging across agencies.
Figure 3 "TiP Community of Practice" Training Model

1. Identify TiP hubs in Afghanistan
2. Identify key institutions and individuals to take part in trainings (government officials, border police, communities, NGOs, media etc.)
3. Assess the understanding of TiP of participants through an online survey
4. Conduct a workshop with all participants to provide the opportunity to assess their own needs in the training. Adapt the training based on the participatory session.
5. For 2 sessions: Separation into groups based on their level of knowledge, and their profession
6. For 2 sessions: Bring together all participants to allow for networking and peer-learning, therefore creating a local community of practice
7. Provide additional training to a “champion” focal point from each profession group for increased ownership and peer-learning ('training of trainers')
8. Identifying local “champions”: giving recognition to local achievements and learning for future scale-up of activities.
Bibliography


IOM. "Enhancing the Safety and Sustainability of the Return and Reintegration of Victims of Trafficking," 2015.


Annexes

1. Evaluation matrix

The Evaluation Matrix focuses on the Q1 and Q2 - relevance and the effectiveness of the material, and provides an overall score for each training material, to identify its strengths and weaknesses. It is an adaptation of the OECD-DAC, that were adapted to this project as this is not a full impact evaluation of one clear programme. Rather, we used these criteria to structure the evaluation matrix for each tool currently under use in a manner which will (a) make the comparison of existing tools to each other stronger; (b) also include feedback on how the tools have been used to date; and (c) ensure the inclusion of a contextual analysis to make sure that the tools are not just well designed but adapted to the needs of their audience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRAINING UNDER REVIEW</th>
<th>RELEVANCE</th>
<th>EFFECTIVENESS</th>
<th>USE</th>
<th>OVERALL SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Publisher (Hagar, IOM)</td>
<td>Year published</td>
<td>Name / Title of the training</td>
<td>Does it include all key information? (low, medium, high)</td>
<td>What information is missing? (low medium, high)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Documents reviewed in the Evaluation matrix

The following list of documents to be evaluated was approved by IOM during the inception phase. Hagar and IOM are currently developing materials for upcoming training sessions. The priority of the research team was to provide operational recommendations to both organisations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Handbook on Direct Assistance for Victims of Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Combating Trafficking in persons in Afghanistan: Brief Training Module for Prosecutors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Badikova Combating Trafficking in persons in Afghanistan: Brief Training Module for Police Officers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Presentation on Information Campaigns and Trafficking in Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Community development training on child trafficking for the low educated population of Kabul at district level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2012-2016</td>
<td>Capacity building for Care Providers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Capacity Building Trainings for Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Training of Lecturers (Academics and Ullama)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Training for Intrenews and IOM</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. **List of Key Informants**

Key Informants have been coded to ensure anonymity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Date of Interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KI01</td>
<td>Head of Strategic Planning Department</td>
<td>17 January 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI02</td>
<td>Ministry of Women Affairs (MoWA)</td>
<td>11 January 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI03</td>
<td>Ministry of Justice</td>
<td>15 January 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI04</td>
<td>AIHRC</td>
<td>21 February 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI05</td>
<td>JSSP</td>
<td>22 February 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI06</td>
<td>“8 Sobh” Newspaper</td>
<td>25 February 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI07</td>
<td>Hagar International</td>
<td>26 February 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI08</td>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>28 February 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI09</td>
<td>Internews</td>
<td>2 March 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI10</td>
<td>Border Police</td>
<td>6 March 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI11</td>
<td>Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit</td>
<td>14 March 2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 4. Completed Evaluation Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRAINING UNDER REVIEW</th>
<th>RELEVANCE</th>
<th>EFFECTIVENESS</th>
<th>USE</th>
<th>OVERALL SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Publisher</strong></td>
<td><strong>Year</strong></td>
<td><strong>Name / Title of the training</strong></td>
<td><strong>Does it include all key information?</strong></td>
<td><strong>How updated are the tools?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Handbook on Direct Assistance for Victims of Trafficking</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Combating Trafficking in persons in Afghanistan: Brief Training Module for Prosecutors</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Combating Trafficking in persons in Afghanistan: Brief Training Module for Police Officers</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Presentation on Information Campaigns and Trafficking in Persons</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Community development training on child trafficking for the low educated population of Kabul at district level</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2012-2016</td>
<td>Capacity building for Care Providers</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Capacity Building Trainings for Government</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Training of Lecturers (Academics and Ullama)</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagar</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Training for Internews and IOM</td>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Detailed evaluation of each available material and curriculum on combating Trafficking in Person in Afghanistan

The following section highlights the key strengths and weaknesses of the materials, in the frame of the research questions agreed upon during the inception phase, and based on the criteria developed in annex 1.


This Handbook is a solid reference for designing materials for training on Trafficking in Persons. It is a comprehensive source to draw the subjects and topics that should be discussed in the trainings. All the key information regarding TIP is included in the handbook, it is well adapted to the international framework for combating trafficking in persons in global level, the chosen language is understandable for readers, and the overall design of the handbook is user friendly. However, there is still a space for further improvement in this handbook. First, a more detailed section regarding the media and its role on different phases of combating trafficking in persons and assistance of victims of trafficking is needed. Second, this handbook is produced in 2007, it is recommended to update the handbook after 10 years to be well adapted to the current situation of TIP in the world.

**IOM - Combating Trafficking in persons in Afghanistan: Brief Training Module for Prosecutors (2009)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Includes a brief explanation of both Afghan as well as International laws on trafficking</td>
<td>The connection between Afghan and international law is not made clear. Highlighting the connection between international and Afghan laws, and giving examples of the cases that the national law meets the requirement of the international law would help the audience further to grasp both international and national laws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The language of the material is clear and understandable for the specific target audience of this training</td>
<td>There is no reference to Islamic law. In Afghan context, it is recommended to have references to Quran and Hadith.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This document gives a comprehensive summary of the definitions, laws, and practices regarding trafficking in persons.</td>
<td>The document is produced in 2009. It is necessary to update the materials for every training every year or after any major shift in the law or the situation of the country.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### IOM - Combating Trafficking in Persons in Afghanistan: Brief Training Module for Police Officers (2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explains both Afghan as well as International laws on trafficking</td>
<td>Absence of real-life examples in the Afghan context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This document gives a comprehensive summary of the definitions, laws, and practices regarding trafficking in persons.</td>
<td>The language of the document should be different from the one for prosecutors as police officers coming from different regions of the country and have different educational and professional backgrounds which are usually not related to the field of law.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The role of police in combating trafficking is not highlighted. The police’s connection to other governmental bodies is not explained.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Although identification of the victims of trafficking is one of the most important responsibilities of the police, there is only a short section on this topic.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlike the presentation that is designed for prosecutors, in this presentation the focus must be on national law rather than international law.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### IOM Presentation on Information Campaigns and Trafficking in Persons (2009)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There is a discussion on information campaign.</td>
<td>Information about the local context is missing throughout the presentation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A comprehensive presentation that covers almost every aspect of TiP and combating TiP practices in theory, for its specific target audience</td>
<td>No connection has been made between the information campaigning and TiP or Afghan context. It is necessary to give some suggestions on how to use information campaign to combat TiP in Afghan context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No active engagement of the participants is envisioned</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Hagar International - Community development training on child trafficking for the low educated population of Kabul at district level / At Risk Community Training (2014)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Giving attention to masses and ordinary people can raise the efficiency level of the combating TiP practices.</td>
<td>Although women form a huge portion of victims of trafficking in the world as well as Afghanistan, no specific information is given about trafficking of women.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using Hadith and different verses of Quran is a good way of communication with people in Afghanistan in order to convey a particular message.</td>
<td>The information about preventing the trafficking is incomplete: It doesn’t explain how in the family and neighborhood or community level people can prevent TiP and reduce the risks. It doesn’t explain the ways that perpetrators deceive people, and how to distinguish between consent and coercion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The language of the presentation is clear and convenient for the purpose of targeting the communities at risk.</td>
<td>No real world example has been given throughout the presentation. There are only two examples as appendix.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No active engagement of the participants is envisioned</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Hagar International - Capacity building for care providers (2012-2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Providing information about TIP, and reintegration and reference, and explaining both in details</td>
<td>Low attention to local context, no example within the Afghan context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The language of the material is well-understandable and clear to target audience.</td>
<td>No explanation about the cooperation between care providers and other governmental and non-governmental institutions to identify the victims of trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No section on the relationship between media and care providers (it is a small chapter in IOM handbook on TiP about the relationship between media and care providers, which can be used as the ground to establish the discussion)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No active engagement of the participants is envisioned</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No section on code of conduct of Care providers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Hagar International - Capacity building for Government (2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explains the organisational structure of combating trafficking unit inside Afghan government</td>
<td>There is no explanation about the international law on TIP. The main focus is on explaining Afghan Law and the structure of High commission of combating Abduction and Trafficking in Persons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There is no discussion on responsible units within the government’s structure regarding combating trafficking. There is a small section on the tasks and responsibilities of different offices and units of the government, but only the role of the ministry of interior and finance office of the ministry is explained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The role of media is not explained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No active engagement of the participants is envisioned</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Hagar - Training for lecturers - Academics and Ullama (2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In-detailed explanation of Afghan law and organisational structure of combating trafficking unit inside Afghan government</td>
<td>The materials that have been used in this training are the same materials that are used for training officials, which means that it is not adapted to its audience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No section is designed on methodological tools to convey messages to students and ordinary people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No section on identifying victims in the society</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Hagar International - Training for Internews (2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion of the media as an participant of counter-trafficking training.</td>
<td>Very broad explanation of different topics on TiP. No in-depth discussion on any aspect of TiP in Afghanistan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No focus on the role of media in combating trafficking and possible strategies that can be realized through media.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No active engagement of the participants is envisioned</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contacts

Samuel Hall is an independent think tank providing research and strategic services, expert analysis, tailored counsel and access to local knowledge for a diverse array of actors operating in the world’s most challenging environments. We specialise in socio-economic surveys, private and public sector studies, and impact assessments for a range of humanitarian and development actors. With a rigorous approach and the inclusion of academic experts, field practitioners, and a vast network of national researchers, we access complex settings and gather accurate data. We bring innovative insights and practical solutions to addressing the most pressing social, economic, and political issues of our time. Samuel Hall has offices in Afghanistan, Kenya and Somalia, and a presence in France, Germany, Tunisia, Turkey and the United Arab Emirates. For more information, please visit www.samuelhall.org